

Scenario 1 - Current beef with current lameness levels

Score sheet			Name of scorer: Expert 7			Comments Round 1			Comments Round 2		
Welfare principles	Welfare criteria	<div>0 – Lowest level of welfare</div> <div>Highest level of welfare – 100</div>	1st round score	90% certain lower bound	90% certain upper bound	2nd round score	90% certain lower bound	90% certain upper bound			
Good feeding	1	Provision and access to food. Animals should have appropriate access to the quantity and quality of appropriate foodstuffs for health and wellbeing.	70	60	80	70	60	80	Lame beef animals do demonstrate weightloss. The won't compete and dmi lower. Increased prevalence 3% to 8-14% (or 20%). DD is spreading amongst beef populations.	Lame beef animals do demonstrate weightloss. The won't compete and dmi lower. Increased prevalence 3% to 8-14% (or 20%). DD is spreading amongst beef populations.	
	2	Provision and access to water. Animals should have appropriate access to the quantity and quality of water for health and wellbeing.	85	80	90	85	70	90	Less movement amongst those affected and increased competition causes problems, especially for pasture animal which might have further to walk	Less movement amongst those affected and increased competition causes problems, especially for pasture animal which might have further to walk. Water quality can be an issue. Water can freeze in winter without knowledge.	
Good housing	3	Animals should have comfort when resting.	80	70	90	80	30	90	Painful getting up and lying down	Painful getting up and lying down. Some poached fields, outwintering, lying on slats	
	4	Animals should have thermal comfort being neither too hot nor too cold.	70	60	80	70	60	80	Unaffected in general	Unaffected in general	
	5	Animals should have sufficient space to move freely.	70	60	80	70	40	80	Lame cattle less mobile	Lame cattle less mobile. Some densely stocked	
Good health	6	Animals should be free from injuries and disorders (e.g. skin conditions, lameness, bone fractures etc.).	65	60	70	65	60	70	More prone to other injuries, especially hocks	More prone to other injuries, especially hocks. Fawc report stated lots of injuries but abattoir cattle largely free of problems except bruising. Delayed treatments while at pasture?	
	7	Animals should be free from disease, including metabolic conditions, with high standards of health care and hygiene.	80	95	75	70	65	85	Some secondary disease, but not the same level of risk as dairy	Some secondary disease, but not the same level of risk as dairy	
	8	Animals should not suffer pain – for example as a result of poor management, handling, surgical or other procedures, slaughter etc.	50	45	60	60	45	70	More animals in pain	More animals in pain. Not sure what proportion castrated, polled etc	
Appropriate behaviour	9	Animals should be able to express normal, non-harmful social behaviours (such as grooming and social bonding).	75	70	85	75	70	85	Fall in social heirarchy	Fall in social heirarchy	
	10	Animals should be able to express other normal behaviours (e.g. foraging, exploring).	55	50	70	55	50	70	Less mobile	Less mobile	
	11	Animals should be handled well with positive and not negative animal-human relationships.	60	50	70	70	60	80	More handling for treatments. As beef animals handled infrequently, this is inherently more stressful.	More handling for treatments. As beef animals handled infrequently, this is inherently more stressful.	
	12	Additional aspects not already adequately covered above in relation to the balance between positive and negative affective states for animals.				65	60	70		To take into account genetics, markets, transport, life duration/worth living, low skill, risk of neglect	

Scenario 2 - Beef production with 3% prevalence lameness mobility scores 2/3

Score sheet			Name of scorer: Expert 7			Comments Round 1			Comments Round 2		
Welfare principles	Welfare criteria	<div>0 – Lowest level of welfare</div> <div>Highest level of welfare – 100</div>	1st round score	90% certain lower bound	90% certain upper bound	2nd round score	90% certain lower bound	90% certain upper bound			
Good feeding	1	Provision and access to food. Animals should have appropriate access to the quantity and quality of appropriate foodstuffs for health and wellbeing.	80	70	90	80	70	90	Some acidosis. Some sucklers and stores outwintered. Small percentages		
	2	Provision and access to water. Animals should have appropriate access to the quantity and quality of water for health and wellbeing.	90	85	99	90	85	95			
Good housing	3	Animals should have comfort when resting.	90	70	95	85	50	90	some slats in NI and Scotland. Some sucklers in cubicles. Small % for short periods often.		
	4	Animals should have thermal comfort being neither too hot nor too cold.	70	60	80	70	60	80	Some cattle get hot as densely stocked, often needing to be clipped.		
	5	Animals should have sufficient space to move freely.	80	70	90	75	70	90	Some of the pens are densely stocked. Pasture based are free ranging		
Good health	6	Animals should be free from injuries and disorders (e.g. skin conditions, lameness, bone fractures etc.).	75	80	70	70	70	80	3% prevalence lameness plus the occasional other injury, meaning most beef cattle remain injury free. The bruising a slaughter shows bruising is common though		
	7	Animals should be free from disease, including metabolic conditions, with high standards of health care and hygiene.	85	95	75	85	75	95	Calf pneumonia and scour an issue from dairy bred beef animals. Parasites and eye infections.		
	8	Animals should not suffer pain – for example as a result of poor management, handling, surgical or other procedures, slaughter etc.	60	70	70	63	50	70	Many beef animals surgically castrated or rubber ring still. Many polled breeds e.g. angus.		
Appropriate behaviour	9	Animals should be able to express normal, non-harmful social behaviours (such as grooming and social bonding).	80	70	90	80	70	90	Calves stay with sucklers, but dairy calves are reared on different units usually. Groups usually remain stable through to slaughter.		
	10	Animals should be able to express other normal behaviours (e.g. foraging, exploring).	60	50	90	60	50	90	Many reared extensively. The indoor beef have little scope to behave as a herd animal. While beef animals rarely forage, many are extensively raised or fed a TMR.		
	11	Animals should be handled well with positive and not negative animal-human relationships.	70	60	80	70	60	80	Unlike dairy, handling usually associated with adverse experience e.g. vaccination, transport or TB test		
	12	Additional aspects not already adequately covered above in relation to the balance between positive and negative affective states for animals.								I'm struggling to see what does not fit elsewhere. I used this previously but regret not trying to take into account elsewhere. I used it as a fudge factor. Could consider genetic fitness?	